TRANSLATION SHIFTS IN THE SOCIAL DILEMMA MOVIE SUBTITLE

Hadena Adipta¹, Ika Kartika Amilia²
Sekolah Tinggi Bahasa Asing LIA, Jakarta, Indonesia¹,²

amilia.ika84@gmail.com

Received: 07/10/2022
Accepted: 26/10/2022
Publication: 01/12/2022

Abstract
This study was intended to investigate the types of translation shifts in a documentary movie entitled The Social Dilemma. The method employed was descriptive qualitative to describe the translation shifts occurring in English-Indonesian movie subtitles. The types of shifts were analyzed using Catford's shift typologies. The findings showed that all types of Catford's shifts were applied in the movie subtitles. From the data collected, it was found that there were 56 level shifts (5%), 327 intra-systems shifts (30%), 243 unit shifts (22%), 83 class shifts (7%), and 392 structure shifts (36%). Based on the findings, the type of shift applied the most was structure shift. This happened since English and Indonesian have different grammatical structures, resulting in obligatory and optional shifts. In the obligatory shifts, the form of the SL sentences must be altered following the rules accepted in the TL culture. On the other hand, the SL form can be retained as long as it is still comprehensible in the TL.

Keywords— Catford’s translation shifts, category shift, level shift

Introduction
Translation means transferring messages from the source language to the target language. It is the transfer process of the meaning or message conveyed in the text in one language to another language in a way intended by the text author (Newmark, 1988). The textual material written in one language is expressed by its equivalent textual material in another (Catford, 1965). The meaning conveyed in the source language (SL) is transferred to the target language (TL) and restructured by using the TL’s accepted grammatical rules (Simatupang, 2000). Therefore, in translation, it is the meaning or message that is transferred and retained, not the grammatical structure. Thus, in translation, the forms (words, phrases, clauses, sentences, or paragraphs) change, and the meaning is transferred from its original language into the target language (Amilia & Yuwono, 2020).

Translation activity appears as one of the solutions to overcome the problem faced by people who do not know a foreign language. It is possible since translators should reproduce the closest equivalence in the target language to convey the message (Nida & Taber, 1982). They further stated that the meaning or messages must come first, followed by the style. Therefore, the translator must understand the author's thoughts in the text and grasp the meaning conveyed in the SL when translating the text into the TL (Andini & Amilia, 2022, p. 41). To produce natural equivalence, the meaning of the source language should be determined vocabulary, grammatical structure, communicative situation, and cultural context analysis. Translators then reproduce the same meaning using equivalent vocabulary, grammatical structures, and cultural context in the target language (Larson, 1984).

Oftentimes, translators face some problems in translating text. However, those problems
can be solved by applying some translation procedures. One of the translation procedures is transposition or shift. To achieve a natural translation, the translator conducts the shift. This means that the translator employs natural forms accepted in the target language.

The study aims to describe the occurrence of level, structure, intra-system, class, and unit shifts in English-Indonesian subtitles of The Social Dilemma, a documentary movie. The types are analyzed by using Catford's shift typology.

Literature Review

According to Vinay and Darbelnet (Munday, 2022), transposition or shift in the translation is a word class change without changing the meaning of the text. This refers to when translators often unintentionally change the type of word, for example from noun to verb. Vinay and Darbelnet divided transposition into mandatory and optional transposition. They refer to the source text (ST) as the foundation expression and the target text (TT) as the transposition.

The term shift or transposition refers to a change in grammar from the source language to the receptor language (Newmark, 1988). There are 4 types of transposition provided by Newmark:

1. A change from plural to singular and changes in the position of adjectives.
2. The changes are needed when the grammatical structure of SL does not exist in the TL.
3. When a literal translation is grammatically possible but may not correspond to natural usage in TL.
4. When a virtual lexical gap is replaced with a grammatical construct.

Shifts are “the departures from formal correspondence in the process of going from the SL to the TL” (Catford, 1965, p. 73). Catford divided shifts into two major types, level and category shifts. A level shift occurs when the SL’s expressions are replaced with their equivalents in the TL at different levels. In other words, it occurs when one item expressed grammatically in a language is expressed lexically in another. The category shift is divided into the structure, unit, class, and intra-system shifts. Structure shift is defined as an arrangement of elements. It occurs when the element structures in a unit from SL are replaced by a different sequence of elements in TL. The unit shift occurs when language units such as sentences, clauses, phrases, or words in a language are replaced by a different unit in another language. The class shift takes place when the equivalence of the SL item is at a different word class or part of speech in the TL. The last kind of shift is intra-system which occurs because of the differences in the number system operates in nominal groups. In English, the system is termed singular or plural. Therefore, the intra-system shift occurs when there is a change from plural to singular, or vice versa.

There are some previous studies discussing the occurrence of translation shifts. One of them is Catford's Translation Shifts Used in Translating the Animal Farm novel written by Susanto, Hilman, and Rasyidie in 2021. The result shows that 38% of data used unit shift, 25% structure shift, 18% intrasystem shift followed by level shift with 15% of occurrence.

The second previous study about the shift is Translation Shift in English Into Indonesian Subtitle of Guzaarish Movie written by Fitria in 2020. This study used a descriptive qualitative method, and the data were collected by documentation. As evidenced by 242 data, the types of shifts discovered are level and category shifts. The level shift displays 93 data points or (38.43 percent). The level shift occurs when an SL item has an equivalent in a TL translation at various language levels, such as grammatical or lexical. The category shift displays total data 149 or (61.57 4 percent). In translation, category shift is associated with deviations from formal correspondence. There are numerous sorts of category shifts: structure shift (80 data or 33.06 percent), intra-system shift (61 data or 25.21 percent), rank or unit shift (7 data or 2.89 percent),
and class shift (only 1 data or 0.41 percent).

The third previous study about the shift is the Translation Shift of “Jakarta Post” newspaper on Monday, November 17, 2014 page 5, The First Column With The Title “UNHAS Deputy Rector Named as Suspected Drug Users” written by Marpaung and Yusrah in 2021. This study used a descriptive qualitative method, and the data were collected by documentation. The writer used the theories of Catford. They are structure shift, unit shift, class shift, and intra-system shift. In 20 sentences (including the title) the writer use 13 data (44,9%) to structure shift, 9 data (31,1%) to unit shift, 6 data (20,6%) to intra-system shift, and 1 data (3,4%) to class shift. Thus, the structural shift is the most dominant shift used by the writer to translate the data.

Research Method

The descriptive qualitative method is used in this study. This approach was used to discover and examine translation shifts in the documentary film, The Social Dilemma, from English into Indonesian. A qualitative approach is classified as if the purpose of the study is primarily to describe a situation, phenomenon, problem, or event (Kumar, 2011).

Qualitative research refers to “meanings, concepts, definitions, metaphors, symbols, and descriptions of things” (Berg & Lune, 2021, p. 12). This definition makes it clear that qualitative research contains all necessary instruments for problem-solving. To collect data from participants in their natural context, qualitative data techniques such as observations, open-ended questions, in-depth interviews (audio or video), and field notes were employed. A qualitative research design is a technique that focuses on data collecting, analysis, and writing. It is derived from disciplines and flows through the research process to identify probable kinds of challenges and the significance of ethical issues (Creswell, 2014). Qualitative research employs five types of study frequently used in the social and health sciences today: narrative, phenomenology, ethnography, case studies, and basic theory.

From those definitions, a qualitative technique is appropriate for this study. The technique is suitable to analyze the data used in this research, which the English transcription and its Indonesian subtitles of The Social Dilemma documentary movie. The kinds of shifts being analyzed are level shifts, class shifts, unit shifts, and intra-system shifts, all primarily based on Catford’s theory.

All of the lines said by the actors in the documentary whose translation (in the form of subtitles) contains several variations provide the data for this study. The source text is written in English, and the target text is written in Indonesian. Both SL and its subtitles are taken from Netflix. The Social Dilemma is an American documentary drama movie directed by Jeff Orlowski and written by Jeff Orlowski, Davis Coombe, and Vickie Curtis. Produced by Larissa Rhodes, the movie was released in the USA on 9 September 2020. The duration of the movie is 1 hour and 34 minutes. The movie is played and aired on Netflix. The movie is translated by Alphino Fajar. This movie addresses the manipulation techniques applied by social media companies to make their users addicted and the psychological aspects leveraged to achieve their goals.

The data collection is conducted by:
1. Watching The Social Dilemma movie.
2. Reading the English version and its Indonesian subtitles.
3. Inputting all the sentences containing shifts into the data table.

When performing the data analysis, the researcher carries out several steps as follows:
1. Analyzing the types of shifts based on Catford’s theory.
2. Consulting online English dictionary and Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI).
3. Draw conclusions.
Results and Discussion

The chart above depicts the distribution of the type of shifts in the movie where level shifts are found in 56 data (5%), intra-systems shifts in 327 data (30%), unit shifts in 243 data (22%), class shifts in 83 data (7%), and structural shifts in 392 data (36%). Based on this finding, the type of shift mostly applied is structure shift.

LEVEL SHIFTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SL</th>
<th>It’s easy today to lose sight of the fact that these tools actually have created some wonderful things in the world.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TL</td>
<td>Saat ini mudah untuk melupakan fakta bahwa alat ini telah menciptakan hal-hal indah di dunia.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sentence above was uttered by Tim Kendall, former president of Pinterest. The phrase *have created* describes social media. He took office as the CEO at the moment, a technology-holding company that builds and invests in companies that embody "tech for good." He said, "the fact that these tools actually have created some wonderful things in the world of social media".

In the sentence above, the activity of creating wonderful things is expressed by using the present perfect. It can be seen from the pattern *have + created*. In English, the present perfect tense is used to describe an event that is finished in the past without exact times. Based on oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, *create* means *to make something happen or exist*. However, in Indonesian, the activity taking place in the past is not described grammatically, but lexically by using *sudah* atau *telah*.

In this datum, *have created* is translated into *telah menciptakan*. According to kbbi.web.id, *telah* means *sudah* (untuk menyatakan perbuatan, keadaan dan sebagainya yang sempurna, lampau, atau selesai). *Cipta* atau *menciptakan* means *membuat* (mengadakan) *sesuatu yang baru* (belum pernah ada, luar biasa, lain dari yang lain). Therefore, the shift occurring in this datum is level shift.
Recently in India, Internet lynch mobs have killed a dozen people, including these five... It's not just fake news; it's fake news with consequences.

Baru-baru ini di India, massa hakim jalanan di internet telah membunuh lusinan orang… Ini bukan sekedar berita palsu, tapi juga berkonsekuensi.

In the above sentence, the phrase have killed refers to misinformation and rumors on social media platforms that remains a problem in India and result in the killing of innocent people.

The activity of killing a dozen people is expressed by using present perfect. It can be seen from the pattern have + killed. In English, the present perfect tense is used to describe an event that is finished in the past without exact times. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, kill means to make somebody/something die.

However, in Indonesian, the activity taking place in the past is not described grammatically, but lexically by using sudah atau telah. In this datum, have killed is translated into telah membunuh. According to kbbi.web.id, telah means sudah (untuk menyatakan perbuatan, keadaan dan sebagainya yang sempurna, lampau, atau selesai). Bunuh means habisi nyawa secara sengaja, whereas membunuh means menghilangkan (menghabisi; mencabut) nyawa; mematikan. Therefore, the shift occurring in this datum is level shift.

We have gone from the information age into the disinformation age.

Kita telah berubah dari era informasi menjadi era disinformasi.

The phrase have gone describes that technology has changed especially when it comes to the distribution of news around the world. This emergence of new technology and social media leads to a change in society as it opens new channels of communication.

In the sentence above, the activity of going from the information age into the disinformation age is expressed by using present perfect. It can be seen from the pattern have + gone. In English, the present perfect tense is used to describe an event that is finished in the past without exact times. Based on oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, the word go is used in many expressions to show that somebody/something has reached a particular state/is no longer in a particular state.

In the TL culture, to deliver the same context, a lexical form is used. The phrase have gone is translated into telah berubah. The word telah is added to show that the activity of going (transforming from information to disinformation age) was started in the past, but the time is not definite. According to kbbi.web.id, the word telah means sudah (untuk menyatakan perbuatan, keadaan dan sebagainya yang sempurna, lampau, atau selesai). Berubah means menjadi lain (berbeda) dari semula. Therefore, the level shift occurs in this datum.

Nobody, I deeply believe, ever intended any of these consequences.

Aku sangat percaya tak ada yang berniat menimbulkan semua konsekuensi ini.
The word consequences by the guy who made Facebook shows his guilt that they are sorry and realize that they have made mistakes. It describes the bad effects of social media in a society that changes the way they think and behave.

According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, consequence means a result of something that has happened, especially an unpleasant result. In the SL, this word is written in a plural form by using the suffix –s even though the word in question actually refers to a single item. The word consequences are translated into konsekuensi. Based on kbbi. web.id, konsekuensi is akibat (dari suatu perbuatan, pendirian, dan sebagainya).

It can be seen that the plural noun consequences is translated into the singular noun konsekuensi. This must be done by translators since Indonesian does not have a suffix to indicate plural nouns. Thus, the intra-system shift takes place in the translation of consequences into konsekuensi.

SL No, she only uses it for recipes.
TL Dia hanya memakainya untuk resep.

The context of recipes here refers to the social media that mom uses to find and get recipes for cooking at home. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, recipe means a set of instructions that tells you how to cook something and the ingredients (= items of food) you need for it. In the SL, this word is written in a plural form by using the suffix –s even though it actually refers to a single item.

The word recipes are translated into resep. Based on kbbi.web.id, resep is keterangan tentang bahan dan cara memasak makanan. It can be seen that intra-system shift is applied in this datum. The plural noun recipes are translated into singular noun resep. This must be done by translators since Indonesian does not have a suffix to indicate plural nouns.

SL I'm trying to touch on many different problems.
TL Aku mencoba membahas beragam masalah.

The word problems stated by Justin refer to his concerns about social media and its effects on society's changes nowadays. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, problem means a thing that is difficult to deal with or to understand.

In this context, the word problem is written in the plural form indicated by the suffix –s, and it is translated into masalah. Based on kbbi. web.id, masalah is sesuatu yang harus diselesaikan (dipecahkan); soal; persoalan.

By looking at the translation, it can be seen that the plural form problems are changed into the singular form masalah. This happens because Indonesian does not have a suffix to indicate plural nouns. Therefore, the translator applies an intrasystem shift in translating the word in question.

UNIT SHIFTS

SL Yes. This is why I spent eight months talking repeatedly to lawyers.
TL Ya. Ini sebabnya kuhabiskan delapan bulan, berbicara berulang kali dengan pengacara.
The word *repeatedly* shows that he had talked and discussed the effects of social media with the public many times. Based on oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, the meaning of *repeatedly* is *many times*. This word is translated into *berulang kali*. Based on kbbi.web.id, *berulang* means *dilakukan lebih dari satu kali; kembali lagi; terjadi lagi*, and the word *kali* is used to *menyatakan kekerapan tindakan*.

By looking at the translation, the shift happening in this translation is the unit shift. *Repeatedly* is a word and it is translated into the phrase *berulang kali*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SL</th>
<th>Every single action you take is <em>carefully</em> monitored and recorded.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TL</td>
<td>Setiap tindakan yang kita lakukan dipantau dan direkam <em>dengan hati-hati</em>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The word *carefully* describes that people are suggested to use social media wisely to avoid problems like stolen data. Based on oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, the meaning of *carefully* is *with a lot of attention or thought, so that you avoid hurting yourself, damaging something, or doing something wrong*. This word is translated into *dengan hati-hati*. Based on kbbi.web.id, *dengan* means *beserta; bersama-sama*, and the word *hati-hati* means *waspada*. Unit shift takes place in this datum. *Carefully* is a word and it is translated into *dengan hati-hati* which is a phrase.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SL</th>
<th>Why don’t you <em>go ahead</em>? Sit down and see if you can get comfy.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The phrase *go ahead* in this part was uttered when the interviewer let the interviewee begin the interview. Based on oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, the phrasal verb *go ahead* means *to begin to do something, especially when somebody has given permission or has expressed doubts or opposition*. This phrase is translated into the word *mulailah*. According to kbbi.web.id, *mulai* means *mengawali berbuat (bertindak, melakukan, dan sebagainya)*. It can be seen that the shift taking place in this datum is the unit shift. *Go ahead* is categorized as a phrase, whereas *mulailah* is a word. The unit shift occurs because there is a change in a language unit from a phrase into a word.

**CLASS SHIFTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SL</th>
<th>This <em>scared</em> me.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TL</td>
<td>Ini membuatku <em>takut</em>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The interviewee showed his fear about the effects of social media before the interview begin. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, *scare* means *to frighten somebody*. In the sentence above, the word *scare* functions as a verb and is written in simple past form, *scared*. The word *scared* is translated into *takut*. Based on kbbi.web.id, *takut* means *merasa gentar (nergi) menghadapi sesuatu yang dianggap akan mendatangkan bencana*. In Indonesian, the word *takut* is categorized as an adjective. Thus, the class shift occurs in the translation because there is a change from a verb into an adjective.
Before the family eats their meals, the mom asked her daughter (Isla) to prepare the table and get everything ready. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, ready means fully prepared for what you are going to do and able to start it immediately. This word belongs to an adjective.

The word ready is translated into siapkan. Based on kbbi.web.id, siap means sudah disediakan (tinggal memakai atau menggunakan saja); sudah sedia. The suffix -kan in Indonesian is used as a suffix that forms a verb. Thus, the word siapkan is a verb. The class shift occurs in this translation because there is a change in the word class, from an adjective (ready) into a verb (siapkan).

The word on describes that even without social media people still can get updated news by browsing the internet. According oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, on means by of something; using something. This word is categorized as a preposition.

The preposition on is translated into sedang mengakses. Based on kbbi.web.id. sedang means masih (dalam melakukan sesuatu); lagi; baru (saja), and the word mengakses means membuat (membuka) akses. In Indonesian, the phrase sedang mengakses expresses an activity which is in the form of a phrasal verb. Thus, the class shift occurs in the translation because there is a change from a preposition into a verb.

**STRUCTURE SHIFTS**

The word real change describes the transformation of life that people feel about the usage of technology. In the SL, the adjective real comes before the noun change. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, real as an adjective in this context means actually existing or happening and not imagined or pretended, and change as a noun means the act or result of something becoming different.

In the TL, the phrase real change is translated into perubahan nyata. It can be seen that the structure of the phrase is changed in the TL. The noun perubahan precedes the adjective nyata. According to kbbi.web.id, perubahan is hal (keadaan) berubah; peralihan; pertukaran, and nyata is benar-benar ada; ada buktinya; berwujud. Thus, the shift occurring in this translation is a structural shift because there is a change in the position of the modifier and head in the translation.
That’s where the term "machine learning" comes from.

Itulah asal istilah “pemelajaran mesin”.

The phrase machine learning refers Google and other social media that people use nowadays to be digital knowledge. In the SL, the word machine functions as a modifier and comes before noun learning. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, a machine means a piece of equipment with many parts that work together to do a particular task, and learning as a noun means the process of learning something.

In the TL, the phrase machine learning is translated into pemelajaran mesin. It can be seen that the structure of the phrase is changed in the TL. The noun pemelajaran precedes the adjective mesin. According to kbbi.web.id, pemelajaran is proses, cara, perbuatan mempelajari, and mesin is perkakas untuk menggerakkan atau membuat sesuatu yang dijalankan dengan roda, digerakkan oleh tenaga manusia atau motor penggerak, menggunakan bahan bakar minyak atau tenaga alam. Thus, the shift occurring in this translation is structure shift because there is a change in the sequence of the modifier and the head in the TL.

Cross-referencing him against comparables in his geographic zone.

Merujuk silang dia dengan yang serupa di zona geografisnya.

The phrase geographic zone describes tagged with GPS data such as street addresses or coordinates. In the SL, the adjective geographic comes before the noun zone. According to oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com, geographic is connected with how the physical features of a place are arranged, and a zone is an area or a region with a particular feature or use.

In the TL, the noun zona comes before the adjective geografis. According to kbbi.web.id, zona is salah satu dari lima bagian besar permukaan bumi yang dibatasi oleh garis khayal di sekeliling bumi, sejajar dengan khatulistiwa (satu zona tropik, dua zona sedang, dan dua zona kutub); jalur iklim, and geografis is bersangkut paut dengan geografi. Therefore, the shift occurring in this translation is structure shift because there is a change in the position of the modifier and head in the TL.

Conclusion

Based on the data analysis, all types of shifts are applied in the subtitles of The Social Dilemma movie. Those are level, structure, unit, class, and intrasystem shifts. The class shift occurs in 83 data or 7%. The intra-system shift occurs in 327 data or 30%. The unit shift occurs in 243 data or 22%. The structure shift has the highest frequency which is 392 data or 36%. The level shift has the lowest frequency which is 56 data or 5%.

The level shift occurs because there is a difference in how English and Indonesian express the activity starting in the past. English uses a grammatical form where the verb can be changed into a simple past or past participle. Meanwhile, in Indonesian, such lexical forms as sudah, telah, or sedang are used to show an activity happening in the past or at the moment of speaking. The class shifts occur when there are changes in the part of speech. The intra-system shifts are applied because there is a difference in the form of numbers between English and Indonesian, where the plural noun in English is often translated into the singular form in Indonesian. The last shift, that is unit, often takes place in the form of phrases changing into words, and vice versa.

All these kinds of shifts can be obligatory or optional. In an obligatory shift, the translator must change the form of the SL sentences following the rules accepted in the TL. On
the other hand, translators can keep the SL form in the translation as long as it is still acceptable in the TL. Therefore, translators are required to comprehend the nature of both languages to produce a natural, comprehensible translation.

References


Orlowski, J. (Director). (2020). *The Social Dilemma* [Motion Picture].
