Edu Cendikia: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan
Volume: 4 | Nomor 03 | Desember 2024 |
DOI: 10.47709/educendikia.v4i03.4998

Analysis of Students' Motivation and Achievement: Comparing BAHASA INGGRIS Textbook and Nias Local Wisdom Materials

Author:
Innes Lestari Zebua[1]
Elwin Piarawan Zebua[2]
Adieli Laoli[3]
Riswan Zega[4]

Afiliation:
Universitas Nias[1,2,3,4]

Corresponding email
Inneslzb15@gmail.com
laoliadieli65@gmail.com
elwinzeb@gmail.com
riswanzegadilfoz@gmail.com

Histori Naskah:
Submit: 2024-11-23
Accepted: 2024-12-07
Published: 2024-12-10

This is an Creative Commons License
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Abstract:
English reading skills are essential for academic success, fostering comprehension, critical thinking, and motivation. Engaging reading materials, particularly those reflecting cultural relevance, like Nias local wisdom, enhance intrinsic motivation and learning achievement. This research compares textbook content with Nias-based texts to assess their motivational impact, employing a mixed-methods approach. Using a Sequential Explanatory Design, the study combines quantitative and qualitative methods for comprehensive insights. Quantitative tests measure reading comprehension and motivation, while qualitative interviews explore students' perceptions. Data integration ensures robust findings, guiding effective educational practices at SMA Negeri 1 Gunungsitoli. The research analyzed texts from the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook ("Little Red Riding Hood") and Nias local wisdom ("Warrior of Sun Hill"). Students scored higher on the Nias text (mean 83.1 vs. 81.9), indicating greater engagement. Interviews revealed stronger intrinsic motivation, such as curiosity, involvement, and challenge, with the Nias text. Extrinsic factors, like grades and compliance, were less influential but still relevant. A readability analysis showed "Little Red Riding Hood" as easier, making it suitable for younger readers. Overall, the study highlights that culturally relevant texts, like Nias wisdom-based materials, significantly boost students' motivation, engagement, and academic performance, underscoring the importance of incorporating intrinsic motivators into English reading curricula.

Kata kunci: Cultural Relevance; Engagement; Mix Method; Readability

Introduction

This research focuses on comparing English reading materials from the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook and Nias local wisdom-based texts, examining their impact on students' motivation and learning achievement. According to Agustina et al. (2021), motivation is a crucial factor that enhances an individual's drive to achieve success, and it is divided into intrinsic and extrinsic types. Intrinsic motivation, arising from a genuine interest in the task itself, significantly boosts academic engagement and long-term success. Extrinsic motivation, driven by external rewards, has a more limited effect on sustained engagement. In the context of English education, fostering intrinsic motivation through culturally relevant materials is a key to enhancing students' learning outcomes. The role of culturally relevant reading materials is further

emphasized by Saota et al. (2023), who argue that teaching materials should align with students' learning needs and cultural contexts. This allows the learning process to be more meaningful and enjoyable, as students can connect with the content on a deeper level. Yusawinur (2021) supports this view by highlighting the importance of local wisdom, which encompasses beliefs, values, customs, and folklore, in providing students with a stronger connection to the material. Nias local wisdom, rooted in the community's interaction with its environment, serves as a rich cultural source that can enhance students' learning experiences.

Literature study

This research explores the impact of motivation and learning achievement on students, specifically through the comparison of English reading materials from the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook and Nias local wisdom-based materials. Motivation plays a crucial role in student engagement and learning outcomes, as highlighted by Dornyei & Ushioda (2018), who define motivation as the driving force behind why individuals engage in activities, how long they persist, and how hard they work to achieve goals. Motivation is categorized into two types: intrinsic and extrinsic. Intrinsic motivation, which arises from an individual's internal interest and satisfaction in an activity, has a more lasting impact on learning, while extrinsic motivation is driven by external rewards or pressures, such as grades or recognition (Schiefele et al., 2020).

Wang & Guthrie (2020) identify key elements of intrinsic motivation in reading, such as curiosity, involvement, and preference for challenge, which can lead to deeper engagement with reading materials. Extrinsic motivation factors, like competition, grades, and compliance, are also influential but often only foster short-term engagement (Wang & Guthrie, 2004). The research adopts Self-Determination Theory (SDT), which posits that intrinsic motivation is enhanced when students' basic psychological needs for autonomy, competence, and relatedness are satisfied. For instance, Nias local wisdom-based materials may provide greater cultural relevance and autonomy for students, increasing their intrinsic motivation. Learning achievement is directly influenced by motivation, as noted by Agustina et al. (2021), who emphasize the importance of fostering motivation to drive academic success.

The significance of culturally relevant reading materials is underscored by Laoli (2021), who asserts that well-chosen reading materials not only enhance language acquisition but also foster critical thinking and creativity. Local wisdom, such as that found in Nias culture, offers valuable insights and provides students with a sense of cultural identity. Local wisdom-based materials, like those developed by Saota (2023) for elementary students in South Nias, have been shown to improve reading skills and motivation by presenting contextually relevant content. Similarly, the integration of local wisdom into writing instructional materials has been found to enhance cultural understanding and improve students' writing skills (Umam, 2023).

In this study, the comparative use of English reading materials and Nias local wisdom-based materials is expected to shed light on how motivation, influenced by the cultural relevance and engagement of the materials, affects students' learning outcomes. By integrating insights from previous research, this study aims to highlight the effectiveness of culturally responsive teaching strategies in enhancing student motivation and academic achievement.

Previous research has explored the relationship between student motivation, learning achievement, and culturally relevant materials. Notably, Khairunnisa Dwinalida and Sholeh Setiaji (2021) found a significant link between motivation and English learning achievement, suggesting that boosting student motivation improves academic outcomes. Erlina Saota's (2023) study developed reading materials based on South Nias local wisdom for elementary students, demonstrating that contextually relevant materials enhance reading skills and motivation. Lastly, Umam (2023) examined how integrating local wisdom into narrative writing

instruction improves cultural understanding and writing skills. These studies inform the current research, which investigates how English reading materials from the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook and Nias local wisdom-based materials influence students' motivation and learning outcomes. They provide valuable insights into the role of motivation and culturally responsive materials in enhancing student.

Research method

This research adopts a mixed-methods approach, combining both quantitative and qualitative methods to analyze the impact of English and Nias local wisdom-based reading materials on student motivation and reading comprehension. The quantitative data includes test results on reading comprehension, while qualitative data comes from semi-structured interviews exploring students' experiences and motivations regarding the materials.

The primary independent variable is the type of reading material (textbook vs. Nias local wisdom-based), and the dependent variables are reading comprehension and student motivation. Data will be collected from students at tenth grade of SMA Negeri 1 Gunungsitoli through tests and interview. The research employs a sequential explanatory design, where quantitative data is analyzed first, followed by qualitative data collection to explain the quantitative findings. The study uses descriptive statistics to analyze the test results, with mean scores compared to assess material effectiveness. Interviews will provide deeper insights into students' attitudes and perceptions, enriching the overall findings and contributing to more effective educational practices.

Result

The study aimed to assess the performance and motivation of students when reading two different texts: one from the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook, titled “Little Red Riding Hood”, and another based on Nias local wisdom, titled “Warrior of Sun Hill”. The research utilized both test results and interviews to examine students’ responses to these texts, with a focus on reading comprehension and motivational factors. The results from the test sheets, which included multiple-choice questions with higher-order thinking skills (HOTS) at levels C4, C5, and C6, revealed that the students performed slightly better when reading the Nias local wisdom-based text. The mean score for the “Little Red Riding Hood” text was 81.9, while the score for the “Warrior of Sun Hill” text was 83.1. Although the difference was small, it suggested that students were more engaged with the Nias local wisdom text, which could be attributed to the cultural relevance and uniqueness of the material.

The students seemed to connect better with the local wisdom text, which may have been more stimulating and interesting for them compared to the more familiar content in the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook. Interviews students explored intrinsic and extrinsic motivational factors that influenced their reading. The intrinsic motivation was largely driven by curiosity, involvement, and the preference for challenge. Many students expressed greater curiosity about the Nias local wisdom text because it presented new and unfamiliar content. For instance, some students mentioned that the Nias text intrigued her due to its cultural significance, which she found rare and engaging. Furthermore, echoed this sentiment, noting that the local wisdom text, being new to her, was especially intriguing because it had been translated into English. The students’ curiosity was a key factor in their deeper engagement with the text. Involvement also played a significant role in motivation. Students reported feeling more connected to the Nias local wisdom text because it related to their personal experiences and cultural backgrounds. Many students also preferred the challenge posed by the Nias local wisdom text.

The complexity of its vocabulary and cultural references motivated students to engage more deeply and stretch their abilities. Some students highlighted that although the Nias text was more difficult, it was challenging in a way that encouraged them to understand and simplify the language. Extrinsic motivations such as competition, compliance, grades, and recognition also influenced students' engagement. Though competition was not the primary motivator, some students noted that their desire to perform well relative to their peers pushed them to engage more with the texts. Compliance, or the obligation to read because it was a class requirement, was also noted as a motivating factor. Grades and recognition from teachers and peers were additional extrinsic motivators. Recognition, although less emphasized, also played a role. For some students, receiving acknowledgment from teachers and peers for their efforts in reading the Nias local wisdom text was motivating. The findings suggest that the Nias local wisdom-based text was more motivating for students due to its cultural relevance and complexity, which fostered both intrinsic and extrinsic motivation.

The study highlighted how integrating culturally significant materials into the curriculum can enhance students' engagement, comprehension, and learning outcomes. Additionally, the research evaluated the appropriateness of the reading materials, using the criteria of suitability, readability, and content relevance. The "Little Red Riding Hood" text was deemed easier to read, while the "Warrior of Sun Hill" text was more challenging but offered greater depth and engagement for students. This supports the idea that culturally relevant texts can not only enrich students' learning experiences but also contribute to better academic performance and motivation.

Discussion

The study analyzed the impact of two different texts, *Little Red Riding Hood* from the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook and *Warrior of Sun Hill* based on Nias local wisdom, on students' reading motivation and achievement. The results showed that students performed slightly better with the Nias local wisdom text, achieving a mean score of 83.1 compared to 81.9 for the BAHASA INGGRIS text. This small but notable difference suggests that students were more engaged with the Nias text, likely due to its cultural relevance. The Nias text connected more deeply with students' cultural backgrounds, encouraging greater cognitive and emotional engagement. Research supports this finding, emphasizing that culturally relevant materials can enhance student engagement and learning outcomes by resonating with their personal experiences and identity.

Interviews with the students revealed several intrinsic and extrinsic motivational factors that influenced their engagement with the texts. Intrinsically, students expressed heightened curiosity about the Nias text, particularly because it presented familiar cultural stories in a new language, English. This novelty sparked interest and motivated them to engage more deeply with the material. Emotional involvement also played a key role, as students found the Nias text more relatable due to its cultural themes. This connection made the reading experience more immersive and enjoyable. Additionally, the challenge posed by the Nias text, with its complex vocabulary and cultural references, motivated students to put in extra effort. This preference for challenging material aligns with Self-Determination Theory, which suggests that tasks providing an optimal level of challenge foster intrinsic motivation.

Extrinsically, several factors also influenced students' motivation. Competition with peers was mentioned by some students as a motivator, with the desire to keep up with classmates pushing them to engage more with the texts. Compliance, or the academic obligation to read, was another significant factor. Some students noted that they felt a duty not only to complete the assignment but also to engage with content that reflected their cultural heritage. Grades were a powerful extrinsic motivator, with several students stating

that their desire for good marks encouraged them to engage more seriously with the texts. Recognition from teachers and peers also influenced their motivation, as students sought validation for their efforts, particularly in relation to the culturally relevant Nias text. Social sharing emerged as another important extrinsic motivator, with students discussing the Nias content with friends and family, which enhanced their understanding and engagement.

The discussion of the reading materials highlighted the differences in suitability and readability between the two texts. The BAHASA INGGRIS textbook, while appropriate for younger learners, lacked the cultural relevance that would engage Nias students on a deeper level. Although it conveyed important moral lessons, it did not offer the same level of personal or cultural connection as the Nias local wisdom text. In contrast, the Nias text was highly suitable for students, as it reflected their cultural heritage and addressed themes such as resilience and personal growth, making it more meaningful and engaging. Its complexity allowed students to explore deeper themes related to identity and cultural pride, making it a more effective learning tool for older students.

Regarding readability, *Little Red Riding Hood* was rated as very easy, with a grade level of 2, making it suitable for younger students but less challenging for senior high school learners. The Nias local wisdom text, rated with a grade level of 9-10, was more appropriate for senior high school students, offering a suitable challenge in both vocabulary and thematic content. The Nias text, therefore, proved to be more suitable for senior high school students, offering both cultural relevance and an appropriate level of complexity, which promoted critical thinking and deeper engagement. While *Little Red Riding Hood* was easier to understand, it lacked the depth required to engage older students at a higher cognitive level.

The Nias local wisdom text emerged as a more effective tool for enhancing student motivation and learning achievement. Its cultural relevance, complexity, and ability to engage students on both cognitive and emotional levels made it a valuable resource for senior high school students. The *Little Red Riding Hood* text, although easy to read, lacked the depth and cultural resonance needed to foster deeper engagement among older students.

Conclusion

The research highlights that culturally relevant reading materials, such as Nias local wisdom-based texts, positively impact students' motivation and learning achievement. Students performed slightly better and were more engaged with these materials, as evidenced by a higher mean score (83.1 vs. 81.9) compared to the BAHASA INGGRIS textbook. Intrinsic motivators like curiosity, involvement, and challenge were more prominent with the Nias text, which fostered deeper engagement and emotional connection. While extrinsic factors like grades played a role, intrinsic motivation driven by cultural relevance was more influential. The study suggests that culturally relevant materials enhance reading motivation and academic performance.

Reference

Aslamiyah, R. (2021). *An analysis reading materials in "bahasa inggris" textbook for vocational high school students* (Doctoral dissertation, IAIN Palangka Raya).

Barella, Y. (2020). Developing local wisdom content in West Kalimantan as English Language teaching material. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa*, *9*(2), 244-252.

Camilla Louise Scanlan.(2020). Preparing for the Unanticipated: Challenges in Conducting Semi-Structured, In-Depth Interviews. SAGE Research Methods.1-19

Dewi, L. M., & Safitri, Y. (2018). THE CORRELATION BETWEEN STUDENTSâ€™ READING MOTIVATION AND THEIR READING COMPREHENSION. *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)*, *1*(6), 750-756.

Fàbregues, S., Sáinz, M., Romano, M. J., Escalante-Barrios, E. L., Younas, A., & López-Pérez, B. S. (2023). Use of mixed methods research in intervention studies to increase young people's interest in STEM: A systematic methodological review. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *13*, 956300.

Harrison, R. L., Reilly, T. M., & Creswell, J. W. (2020). Methodological rigor in mixed methods: An application in management studies. *Journal of mixed methods research*, *14*(4), 473-495.

Tobias Krettenauer & Randall Curren (2020) Self-determination theory, morality, and education: introduction to special issue, Journal of Moral Education, 49:3, 275-281.

Laoli, A. (2021). Activate Reading Comprehension of Second Language Acquisition (SLA) By Applying Know-Want to Know-Learned (KWL) Strategy. *IJEE (Indonesian Journal of English Education)*, *8*(2), 179-197.

Lumepa RA, Jim Ronny Tuna and Fivy A. Andries.(2021) Readability Assessment of Reading Texts in Pathway to English for SMA/MA Grade X *Universitas negeri manado. 408-420*

Ren, S. (2023). The Application of Schema Theory to the Teaching of Reading Comprehension. *Journal of Education and Educational Research*, *2*(3), 86-88.

Robbani, A. S., & Khoirotunnisa, U. (2021). Online English Comics as Reading Materials for English Language Education Department Students. *European Journal of Educational Research*, *10*(3), 1359-1369.

Saota, E., Rasyid, Y., & Pujiati, H. (2023). Teaching Materials For Bahasa Indonesia Reading Skills Based On Local Wisdom With A Quantum Approach. *Getsempena English Education Journal*, *10*(1), 27-42.

Sobahiya, M.(2022). An Analysis Of The Suitability Of Reading Materials In English Textbook Entitled "Smart English Book" For Senior High School At Eleventh Grade With 2013 Curriculum.

Sumardjoko, B., & Subowo, A. (2021). The implementation of Javanese local wisdom values as strengthening the practice of pancasila. In *Social, Humanities, and Educational Studies (SHEs): Conference Series* (Vol. 4, No. 4, pp. 186-193).

Wang, X., Jia, L., & Jin, Y. (2020). *Reading amount and reading strategy as mediators of the effects of intrinsic and extrinsic reading motivation on reading achievement. Frontiers in Psychology*, *11*, 586346.

Yang, J. (2023). The use of schema theory in the teaching of reading comprehension. *Journal of Education and Educational Research*, *4*(1), 59-61.